**Appendix 3** Deliberating divergent views on tree planting

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Actor** | **Frame used** | **Deliberation mechanism** |
| Conservationist 8 | Environmental frame:*Brings up that maximising conifer production is a ‘massive threat’ and grouse moors should not be planted up with trees.* | Cueing |
| Business 3 | Economic frame:*Counterargues by pointing to the economic potential of tree planting for upland famers:**‘We haven’t got a lot of choice of what we can do in the uplands, it’s cattle, sheep … The only other potential option the world has got to do anything good out of this upland, is trees, and it’s been totally overlooked. … forestry in the world of finance … it’s beaten any other type of investment over the last twenty years, it’s beaten commercial property, it’s beaten any sort of, like financial investments, and here we’ve got the land to do it.’* | Keying |
| Farmer 3 | Economic frame:*Confirms economic potential* | Amplifying |
| Business 3  | Economic frame:*Adds detail to the economic benefits for his farm**‘I would like to plant some trees on our farm … I want to have shelter for my sheep, we’ve got to do more and more off the farm, because people … can’t make their whole livelihood off a farm anymore.’* | Amplifying |
| Conservationist 5 | Environmental frame:*Points to negative effects on biodiversity:* *‘So where are you going to put these trees?... it’s going to go on the enclosed land, so can my point be, some of those areas are the most important areas for biodiversity, some of them.’* | Keying  |
| Business 3 | Environmental frame plus localisation frame: *Agrees to environmental frame, but points to wrong facts about tree sizes that informed environmental regulations, and the need to consider local conditions:* *‘I take on board … some of the guidelines that are put forward as to how negative spruce plantation is … What we’ve been told and what we see from previous experience, the previous trees we’ve already got on our farms is totally, totally untrue. We were told that like a lapwing on the syca spruce plantation of seven-hundred metres, that’s rubbish, we’ve got trees on the farm already and they’ll go for fifty metres.’**‘… Okay I think there needs to be some, a bit of a steering for guidelines … not just an absolute categorical blank ‘no’, for the syca spruce trees are related to the devil.’* | Layering |
| Facilitator | Takes up localisation frame, adds the notion of flexibility:*‘Let me just summarise that, so what you’re saying is, if we’re taking this back to the context, there needs to be more flexibility with regard to forestry.’* | Amplifying |
| Business 3 | Agrees |  |
| Conservationist 5 | Combines environmental and economic frame:*‘But don’t repeat mistakes. We had some terrible forestry, the wrong trees put in the wrong place, and they’ve flipped over, they haven’t produced any decent─* | Amplifying, merging |
| Business 3 | Agrees: *‘Well the floor box should never have been planted.’* |  |
| Conservationist 5 | Environmental and economic frame:*‘No, exactly, yeah, and big chunks of Dumfries and Galloway should never have been planted. … A massive proportion of the counties were just covered in trees, which doesn’t make money for anybody, it’ll cost more money to take them out.’* | Amplifying |